Executive Summary

Introduction

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Trust Board ("the Church") is seeking resource consent for the demolition of the 'Block Plant' building in Temple View. This building is listed as a B-Ranked Historic Heritage Item (H135) in the Operative District Plan ("ODP"). The building is located at 435-495 Tuhikaramea Road. The site is zoned Temple View Zone and is located within the Temple View Character Area. In addition, the Block Plant is located in an area which is subject to a Comprehensive Development Plan ("CDP 2"). The location of the Block Plant is shown in Image 1 below.

Image 1 Location of Block Plant on subject site.

Area Background

Commencing in 2009, the Church has been through a comprehensive master-planning process for the Temple View campus. In January 2016 the Trust Board applied for land use consent for a Comprehensive Development Plan (CDP) to guide re-development of the mid-section of the former Church College site, which became known as the CDP2 area. The CDP2 area included multiple historic buildings comprising the Mendenhall Library (H109), the First House (H133), the GRB Building (H107), the Kai Hall (H134), and the Block Plant (H135). It is noted that the consent for CDP2 area included the retention of the Block Plant (H135).

In June 2017 and July 2018 respectively, Comprehensive Development Plans for CDP Areas 1 and 3 were approved. The CDP 1 area encompassed the northern section of the Church College site, including the former David O McKay building whereas the CDP3 area encompassed the Temple and

the former Visitors Centre. All three CDP areas are in various stages of redevelopment at the time of this application.

Historically, approximately 14 hectares of the Church College site sat within Waipa District but became part of Hamilton City in 2014. In February 2019, Hamilton City Council publicly notified Plan Change 3 (PC3) to the ODP, the primary purpose of which was to rezone the former Waipa land to 'Temple View Zone' in order to align its zoning with the balance of the Church College site. Decisions on PC3 were publicly notified on 11 September 2019 and the plan change became fully operative in December 2019.

Block Plant History

A full historic summary of the Block Plant can be found in the Built Heritage Inventory Record Form available via the application website. The following excerpt is taken from this document:

The Block Plant was built by Perry Brown and his crew in 1955 or early 1956. They constructed a building and assembled the 'new machine' which replaced the first 1951 block plant machine. The new machine was referred to as the Columbia block machine and was shipped from the State of Washington. The building consisted of a central plant where the Columbia Block machine was installed, a block curing area, a cement storage shed, generator room, plumbing shop, and paint storage area.

In March 1956 the first blocks, which are brick sized, came off the new Columbia Block machine. The new machine provided the option of different block sizes and shapes through the use of different moulds. About 4000 blocks could be produced a day. As of December 1957 the Columbia Block Machine had made nearly 900,000 blocks, not counting half blocks or special blocks (Rongo Pai 1958:173). The Columbia Block Machine produced the blocks used in the Temple, Information centre, McKay building, Headmaster's Home, Temple President's home, missionaries homes, machine shop, timber treatment plant, covered walks at the college, as well as the Dinsdale Chapel. More than 250,000 blocks were shipped to the Pacific Islands. The old Columbia Block plant is now used as the rugby changing rooms.

The Church College complex included classrooms, dormitories, gymnasium, auditorium, a library and amenities. The construction of the college was part of a programme of expansion within New Zealand and the Pacific, with the construction of several chapels. Construction of the Temple commenced in 1956 and it was dedicated 20 April 1958. For the construction of the complex, temporary accommodation units and facilities were set up in a camp which had its own kai hall and laundry. A block factory and a joinery factory were also established. The cement block (brick) plant was in operation by July 1951, using imported cement. The joinery workshop was the first main building constructed the first bricks for this being laid on 12 August 1952. The ground-breaking ceremony for G.R. Biesinger Hall was held in 1960 and the large Wendell B. Mendenhall Library was opened on campus on 16 February 1964.

Current Application

This resource consent application is for the demolition of the Block Plant building, which is a B-Ranked Historic Heritage item in the Operative District Plan. The demolition of a B-Ranked item is a Discretionary Activity pursuant to Rule 19.3 i) of the Operative District Plan. In addition to the above application, the applicant has applied for a Change of Conditions to the CDP2 consent to authorise the removal of the Block Plant. This consent has since been withdrawn until such time as a decision is made on the current resource consent.

The resource consent application states that the cleared site will be re-purposed for residential

development and associated infrastructure, including roading. It is further proposed that a memorial plinth be erected in the vicinity of the Block Plant for the purpose of memorialising the form and function of the Block Plant building. The plinth will direct visitors to the nearby Museum where detailed records of the Block Plant are held. In addition, the applicant proposes to include memorial items associated with the Block Plant as part of the proposed rose garden memorial to be developed immediately north of the Mendenhall Building.

The application is supported by specialist reports, including:

- Heritage Assessment prepared by Archifact, dated November 2019
- A Seismic Assessment prepared by Beca, dated July 2009 and updated 6 March 2020
- Alterative Use Concepts plans Offices & Apartments prepared by Walker Architects;
- Alternative Use Seismic Advice plans prepared by Beca Consultants dated April 2020;
- Alternative Use Costings prepared by CJM Quantity Surveyors dated April 2020;
- A Market Valuation Report prepared by Telfer Young, dated 29 April 2020
- An Adaptive Re-use Options memorandum prepared by Archifact, dated 7 May 2020
- A Heritage cumulative effects memo prepared by Archifact dated 1 April 2020

The Heritage Assessment provides an assessment of the historic significance of the Block Plant building against the assessment criteria set out in the Hamilton City Council Operative District Plan, Volume 2 Appendix 8 section 8-1.2. This includes an assessment of the historic qualities, physical/aesthetic/architectural qualities, context or group qualities, technological qualities, cultural qualities and scientific qualities. Further assessment is provided in the subsequent memos with regards to adaptive re-use and potential cumulative effects of the demolition of the block plant.

The Seismic Assessment determined that the overall building performance is limited to 40-50% of the new building standard (NBS). This is assessed to be above the 33% NBS threshold that defines an "Earthquake Prone" building in terms of the Building Act 2004. As this building falls below 67% NBS, the report states that the building is categorised an "Earthquake Risk" building in terms of the definition recommended by the New Zealand Society of Earthquake Engineering. Accordingly, if the Block Plant was altered to accommodate an "alternative use" there will likely be a statutory requirement to undertake strengthening. The report discusses and recommends strengthening options that would increase the building performance to 67% NBS, as well as options that would improve the performance to 80-100% NBS.

An economic assessment of two alternative uses, being residential and office use, is provided in the Market Valuation report. This report concludes that repurposing of the Block Plant as either residential accommodation or an office is not economically feasible based on cost.