

IN THE MATTER of applications pursuant to the
Resource Management Act 1991

BY Foodstuffs North Island Limited

FOR Resource consent for the
construction and operation of a new
supermarket with an associated drive
through fuel facility including car
parking and all other enabling works.

**SECOND SUPPLEMENTARY STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE
(Transportation)**

Alastair Black

8 October 2019

INTRODUCTION

1. My name is Alastair James Black. My qualifications and experience are set out in my primary statement of evidence.
2. In preparing this evidence I have reviewed the following information:
 - a. Statement of Evidence of John Burgess on behalf of Foodstuffs, 20 September 2019;
 - b. Statement of Evidence of John Parlane on behalf of The Base Te Awa Limited, 27 September 2019;
 - c. Statement of Evidence of Don McKenzie on behalf of Woolworths, 27 September 2019; and
 - d. Supplementary Statement of Evidence of John Burgess on behalf of Foodstuffs, 7 October 2019.
3. The purpose of this second supplementary statement of evidence is to provide my view based on revisions to the proposal, respond to submitters expert evidence and provide comments on the revised conditions of consent (dated 7 October 2019).

THE REVISED PROPOSAL

4. Based on the revised site plan provided by Mr Burgess (dated 19 September 2019), I understand that the proposal has been modified to address issues raised in my Supplementary Statement of Evidence. These changes include:
 - a. Modifying the proposed roundabout to include:
 - i. A single northbound departure lane at the proposed roundabout;
 - ii. Providing a splitter island on the Maui Street approach.
 - b. A pedestrian crossing facility on Karewa Place;
 - c. Indicating the location of the Couplands Bakery vehicle crossing;
 - d. A shared path on Eagle Way and Te Rapa Road; and
 - e. One-way operation of the fuel forecourt.

WAIRERE DRIVE / KAREWA PLACE INTERSECTION

5. I support the proposed partial signalisation of the Karewa Place/ Wairere Drive intersection to facilitate right-in movements from Wairere Drive. This is required to mitigate unacceptable delays that would otherwise result at Te Rapa Road/ Eagle Way/ The Base Parade and Te Rapa Road/ Wairere Drive.

6. I agree that for the partially signalised intersection to be safe, the Wairere Drive speed limit must be no more than 60km/h.
7. As has been stated by the other traffic experts, I understand that the setting of speeds limits is not a matter that can be controlled through the Resource Management Act, but is a road controlling function provided for by the Local Government Act. I share their concerns that there is no certainty the speed limit on Wairere Drive will be lowered to 60km/h through that process.
8. No detailed speed management proposal has been developed for lowering of the speed limit on Wairere Drive. The Land Transport Rule: Setting of Speed Limits 2017 specifies the minimum length of a 60km/h speed limit as 500m. There is only 400m between the Wairere Drive intersections with Pukete Road and Te Rapa Road, so any proposal to lower the speed limit will likely need to consider lowering the limit over a longer length of Wairere Drive.
9. There is a risk that lowering the speed limit to 60km/h will require additional engineering works at the adjacent intersections to support the lower speed limit. The extent of any additional engineering works will only be confirmed when a speed limit proposal is developed and consulted upon. It is unclear who would be responsible for funding and implementing any additional engineering works to support a lower speed limit.

EAGLE WAY/ KAREWA PLACE/ MAUI STREET EXTENSION ROUNDABOUT

10. The revised roundabout layout addresses the concerns raised in my Supplementary Statement of Evidence¹. I consider that residual issues such as the details of the roundabout and integration of the Coupland's access can be confirmed during detailed design and reviewed as part of the proposed road safety audits.
11. Mr McKenzie² is concerned about the lack of the walking and cycling facilities on Eagle Way and Maui Street. I share his concerns and consider that additional crossing facilities are desirable. I support his recommendation to expand Condition 51 to require a pedestrian crossing facility on Eagle Way. However, it can be difficult for pedestrians to cross multi-lane roundabout approaches and

¹ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 9-15

² SOE of Don McKenzie, para 7.8

exits and I consider it appropriate for any new pedestrian crossing facilities near the roundabout to be subject to a road safety audit.

SITE ACCESS

Site Access – Te Rapa Road

12. As stated in my earlier evidence³, I support a left turn entry to the site from Te Rapa Road provided it meets the appropriate design standards and provides an off-road shared path to match the existing facility.
13. There has been no assessment of effects on how the proposed deceleration lane will impact on the safe and efficient access to the neighbouring properties. Mr Burgess⁴ states that *“the applicant is currently in discussion with the neighbours to develop an integrated access solution...”*, however, no further information or detail on the location or form of access has been provided at the hearing.
14. Currently both properties have separate vehicle crossings. I have shown the approximately location of these existing crossings on Figure 1. I am unaware of other situations where property accesses are provided within a deceleration lane.



Figure 1: Access to Te Rapa Road

15. As stated in my earlier evidence⁵ *“While I support the revised access arrangements to Te Rapa Road there is insufficient detail to complete an assessment of the proposed layout and potential effects”* and that *“Further information is required to assess the impact on access to the neighbouring*

³ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 20

⁴ SOE of John Burgess, para 99

⁵ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 21

property.⁶ I consider that more information should be provided so that the effects on access to the neighbouring properties can be understood.

16. I am concerned that:
- a. Vehicles exiting from the neighbouring sites will need to cross the deceleration lane to travel south on Te Rapa Road or to turn right into The Base Parade.
 - b. Vehicles in the deceleration lane will shadow following vehicles that are continuing south on Te Rapa Road. There is a risk that drivers may exit the neighbouring property without seeing these following vehicles resulting in crossing type crashes.
 - c. Providing two vehicle crossings across the deceleration lane will be confusing for following drivers. It will be unclear to following driver whether other vehicles are slowing to access the neighbouring properties or Pak'n Save. This could result in rear-end crashes.

These are the same concerns that lead the traffic experts to recommending removal of the right turn out of the site to Te Rapa Road.

Site Access – Eagle Way

17. I support the amendments to the Eagle Way access which include:
- a. Reducing the width to 8.8m;
 - b. Requiring that the crossing be designed to provide pedestrian priority; and
 - c. Signs and markings clearly identify the fuel facility as one-way.
18. Mr McKenzie⁷ recommends that some form of median protection between the inbound and outbound lanes is provided to prevent conflict on the Eagle Way access. I note that this would restrict the fuel facility to left-out, meaning it could only be visited when departing from the site. The provision of a median within the site could be reviewed through the safety audits.
19. In summary, I support the proposed changes to the site access on Eagle Way which address the concerns raised in my Supplementary Statement of Evidence⁸.

⁶ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 24a

⁷ SOE of Don McKenzie, para 7.17

⁸ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 27-28

Site Access – Maui Street Extension

20. The revised Maui Street access now includes a significantly short deceleration lane and a single departure lane from the roundabout. I understand that Mr Burgess⁹ would accept removal of the short deceleration lane if this was Council's preference.
21. My preference is that the deceleration lane is removed to minimise the risk of safety effects described in my supplementary evidence¹⁰. I understand that this is also the preference of Mr McKenzie¹¹ and Mr Parlane.

NO STOPPING ON KAREWA PLACE

22. Two submitters expressed safety concerns from the increased traffic on Karewa Place where parked vehicles currently limit sight distance at property accesses. I understand that the concerns primarily relate to 9 Karewa Place.
23. Currently on-street parking is available on the western side of Karewa Place and for approximately 200m on the eastern side. The extent of no-stopping restriction is shown at Appendix 1.
24. The District Plan (Volume 2, Table 151g and Figure 15-1h) provides the requirements for sight distance at driveways. Karewa Place is a Collector road in the District Plan hierarchy. For collector roads with a 50km/h speed limit, 70m sight distance is required. Furthermore, it states that parked vehicles may occasionally obstruct sight lines on minor arterial, collector and local transport corridors.
25. To provide 70m sight distance, approximately 80m of additional no stopping would be required to ensure that clear sight distance is not obstructed by parked vehicles. The likely extent is shown as red dashed lines on the figure at Appendix 1. This would permanently remove 4-5 parking spaces.
26. I have reviewed the NZ Transport Agency Crash Analysis System. In the period 2014-2019, there has been one reported non-injury crash on Karewa Place related to vehicle manoeuvring at property accesses. This involved a vehicle turning right out of a property being struck by a northbound vehicle at 5.30pm on a Sunday. I note that at peak periods it may be difficult to find a gap to turn right

⁹ SOE of John Burgess, para 99

¹⁰ Supplementary SOE of Alastair Black, para 33

¹¹ SOE of Don McKenzie, para 7.10

out of some properties but the proposed roundabout will enable drivers to turn left-out and u-turn, or u-turn before turning left into a property, reducing the need for right-turns.

27. I no longer support a condition requiring additional no stopping on Karewa Place. If safety effects do arise from parked vehicles combined with the increase traffic volume, Council could implement no stopping through their road controlling function under the Local Government Act.

COMMENTS ON CONDITIONS

28. I have the following comments on the proposed conditions circulated by the Applicant on 7 October 2019.

Condition 33

29. I support the change to Condition 33 requiring submission of engineering plans for works within the road corridor.

Condition 46

30. As discussed above, I consider that more detail is required to assess how the neighbouring vehicle crossings will interact with the proposed Te Rapa Road deceleration lane.
31. If no further information is provided and consent is granted, it would be prudent to allow some flexibility in Condition 46 so that the design of the deceleration lane and neighbouring vehicle crossings can be amended during detailed design and engineering approval.
32. I do not consider that the Applicant's revised condition provides sufficient certainty that the effects on access to the neighbouring properties can be mitigate. I have suggested an alternative condition below.

Applicant's Condition:

*Prior to operation of the supermarket Aa left turn deceleration lane on Te Rapa Road is shall be constructed in accordance with the **Austroads Guide to Road Design** relevant standard ~~Austroads Design Practices standards~~, or to the satisfaction of HCC, to mitigate ~~avoid~~ operational and safety concerns and to provide ~~access off~~ a left-turn entry Te Rapa Road into the site from Te Rapa Road.*

My alternative wording:

*Prior to operation of the supermarket a left turn deceleration lane on Te Rapa Road shall be constructed in accordance with the **Austrroads Guide to Road Design** or to the satisfaction of HCC. **The purpose of the deceleration lane is to mitigate operational and safety concerns and to provide a left-turn entry into the site from Te Rapa Road. The design shall demonstrate how the operational and safety concerns on access to the properties at 1000 Te Rapa Road and 1006 Te Rapa Road will be mitigated.***

Condition 47 and Condition 48

33. I support the proposed amendments to Condition 47 and Condition 48 which providing more detail on the layout of the proposed intersections.
34. My preference is that the short deceleration lane at the Maui Street access to the supermarket is removed. Unless the site plan is updated to remove this deceleration lane, Condition 48 will require further amendment.

Condition 49

35. I consider that the partially signalised intersection of the Wairere Drive/ Karewa Place intersection must be accompanied by a reduced speed limit of no more than 60km/h. I have no further amendments to this condition.

Condition 51

36. As discussed above, I support the proposed amendments to Condition 51 relating to pedestrian crossing facilities.

Condition 54

37. As discussed above, I no longer consider that additional parking restrictions are required at this time to mitigate effects of this proposal and support deletion of Condition 54.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

38. In summary, I consider that:
 - a. The adverse effects of the proposal require mitigation including partial signalisation of the Wairere Drive/ Karewa Place intersection and a roundabout at the Eagle Way/ Karewa Place/ Maui Street intersection. Without this mitigation, the proposal will have significant adverse effects on the transport network.

- b. I agree with the other traffic experts that the partially signalised intersection must be accompanied by a reduced speed limit on Wairere Drive of no more than 60km/h.

- c. More detail is required to assess how the neighbouring vehicle crossings will interact with the proposed Te Rapa Road deceleration lane. There is a risk that allowing vehicle crossings to the deceleration lane could result in unacceptable adverse safety effects.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'A. Black', written in a cursive style.

Alastair Black

Dated 8 October 2019

APPENDIX 1: KAREWA PLACE PARKING RESTRICTIONS

